The Global Economy

Labor Markets

Nobel prizes

• Eugene Fama
  – Known for: “efficient markets” ≠ perfect markets
  – Bottom line: diversify, keep costs low
• Robert Shiller
  – Known for: “irrational exuberance,” “behavioral finance”
  – Bottom line: stock prices vary more than dividends ⇒ someone must be irrational
• Lars Hansen
  – Known for: “pricing operators”
  – Bottom line: stock prices vary more than dividends ⇒ the action must be in the valuation

Red tape in Spain

http://youtu.be/0aHEKmuGmiM

• Spain ranks 136 (of 185) in ease of starting a business
  – Below Peru (60), Uzbekistan (90), and Nigeria (119)
  – Above Chad (181) and Haiti (183)
• Source: Doing Business

Where we’ve been

• Essential tool: production function
  \[ \frac{Y}{L} = A \left( \frac{K}{L} \right)^\alpha \]
• Sources of country performance
  – Capital per worker \( \frac{K}{L} \)
  – Productivity \( A \)
• Institutions: sources of productivity
  – Governance
  – Rule of law
  – Property rights
  – Competitive markets

Where we’re going

GDP

Capital & Labor

Productivity

Political Process

“Institutions”
Roadmap

• Regulation good and bad
• What’s going on in France?
• Labor market indicators
• Labor market analysis
• Labor market “protection” and “flexibility”
• Examples
• What’s going on in Denmark?

Regulation good and bad

• James Surowiecki, *New Yorker*, June 10, 2010
  – Regulation isn’t an obstacle to thriving markets, it’s a vital part of them.
• Examples of good regulation? Bad?

The idea for the day

• Regulation can be good or bad
  – Can facilitate productive activity
  – Can also be an obstacle to it
  – Needed: balance
• Today’s examples
  – Labor markets (first half)
  – Financial markets (second half)
  – Both essential to economic performance

What’s going on in France?

• *Bloomberg Business Week*, May 3, 2012
  – Once a company has at least 50 employees, management must create three worker councils, introduce profit sharing, and submit restructuring plans to the councils if the company decides to fire workers for economic reasons.
• What’s going on here? Who wins? Who loses?
What’s going on in France?

• Christopher Caldwell, Financial Times, Feb 05:
  – In early 2000, when the French unemployment rate was 9.6%, Martine Aubry, the Socialist labour minister, shepherded into law a bill that capped the work-week of most employees at 35 hours. She called it “a necessity for job creation.” Today French labour participation is rock-bottom among developed countries.

• What’s going on here? Who wins? Who loses?

What’s going on in France?

• Liz Alderman, NYT, February 20, 2013
  – “How stupid do you think we are?” wrote Titan CEO Maurice Taylor, an American. “The French work force gets paid high wages but works only three hours. They have one hour for their breaks and lunch, talk for three and work for three.” He was roundly condemned in France for his “predatory” American corporate culture.

• What’s going on here? Who wins? Who loses?

What’s going on in France?

• Jacqui Cheng, “Sacre bleu!” Ars Technica, March 13, 2013
  – It’s a rule of retail life that you often have to work long past closing time while you clean up or do inventory for the following day. But Apple Store employees in France won’t have to do this anymore. Apple has been ordered to stop asking its retail employees to work past 9pm and must now pay €10,000 in damages. French labor laws forbid requiring employees to work between 9pm and 6am (as well as Sundays, all day).

• What’s going on here? Who wins? Who loses?

What’s going on in France?

• How do France and the US compare?
  – Unemployment?
  – Employment?
  – Hours worked?
  – GDP per capita?

Unemployment rate

![Unemployment_rate_graph](image)

Source: OECD.

Employment rate

![Employment_rate_graph](image)

Source: OECD.
What’s going on in France?

- How would you summarize the evidence?
- Explain it?

Labor Market Indicators

Labor market indicators

- What the numbers mean
- Why experts prefer employment to unemployment

Employment “status” in the US

GDP per capita and GDP per hour worked

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Y/POP</th>
<th>Y/L</th>
<th>Y/hL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>US</td>
<td>34,875</td>
<td>67,865</td>
<td>37.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td>25,664</td>
<td>56,909</td>
<td>37.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ratio</td>
<td>1.36</td>
<td>1.19</td>
<td>1.012</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Source: BLS, Jan 2012.
Standard indicators

- Employment rate = employed/working-age population
- Labor force = employed + unemployed
- Unemployment rate = unemployed/labor force
- Participation rate = labor force/working-age population
- Inactivity rate = out of labor force/working-age population
- Hours worked = average hours worked of employed people

Employment status in the US

Population 16+: 242.268
Labor force: 154.395
Employment rate: 58.5%
Unemployment rate: 8.3%
Participation rate: 63.7%

Ways to reduce unemployment

- Unemployed get jobs
  - Raises employment rate
- Unemployed leave labor force
  - Employment rate doesn’t change
  - Unemployment rate falls
- Which is more informative
  - Employment or unemployment?

Unemployment rates

Source: OECD

Unemployment rates, youths

Source: OECD
**Labor Market Analysis**

**Why unemployment?**

- Are jobs like donuts? hotel rooms? something else?
- Evidence overwhelming that the number of jobs isn’t fixed, it responds to circumstances

---

**Frictionless labor market model**

**Institution: minimum wage**
Institution: minimum wage

- What happens to unemployment? Why?
- Is this a big effect or a small one?
- Who wins in the model? Who loses? Which is bigger?
- Who wins in the real world? Who loses? Which is bigger?

Institution: minimum wage

- If we doubled pay at McDonald’s, what would happen?

Minimum wage (fraction of median)

![Minimum wage graph]

Source: OECD.

Institution: minimum wage

- Milton Friedman (paraphrase)
  - The minimum wage is discrimination against people with low skills, because it forces firms to pay a wage greater than their skill supports. As a result, many of them are unemployed, rather than working and developing skills that would improve their prospects.
  - Do you agree or disagree? Why?

Institution: minimum wage

- Gary Becker, Becker-Posner blog:
  - Generous minimum wages and other rigidities of the French labor market caused unemployment rates that have remained stubbornly high. Immigrants, youths, and other new entrants into the labor market have been hurt the most.
  - Do you agree or disagree? Why?
“Protection” v “flexibility”

What you’ll be dealing with in other countries

Doing Business
- Least flexible labor market = Portugal
- Most flexible labor market = New Zealand
- Examples of “euro” and “anglo” models

Employment protection law (EPL) governs
- Fixed term contracts
- Overtime compensation
- Dismissal
- Collective bargaining

Fixed-term contracts

PRT Fixed term contracts allowed only in special situations (such as seasonal activity)

NZL Fixed term contracts are unrestricted, with no maximum duration period

Overtime

PRT Mandatory premium for overtime ranges from 50% to 75%, additional restrictions on night work, and there are 24 days of paid leave per year.

NZL No required premium for overtime, no restrictions on night work, and the minimum paid leave is 15 days per year.

Dismissal

PRT List of fair grounds for terminations and stringent procedures for dismissals, such as mandatory notification of the government and priority rules for re-employment of redundant workers.

NZL Allows “contracts at will,” which can be terminated without notice without cause.

Rigidity of hours (index)

Firing costs (weeks of wages)
"Protection" v "flexibility"

Collective bargaining

**PRT** Employers have a legal duty to bargain with unions, collective agreements are extended to third parties by law, workers councils are mandatory, and employer lockouts are prohibited.

**NZL** Employers have no legal obligation to bargain with unions, collective agreements are not extended, labor participation in management is not required, and employer lockouts are allowed.

---

**Union rights (index)**

---

**Employment protection overall (index)**

---

**Employment protection over time**

---

**France revisited**

- What happened?
- Would you build a plant there? Locate a bank?

---

**Examples**
Examples

- Countries where you’ve had experience?

India

- Shankar Acharya, “Ten myths about India,” FT Forum, Feb 1, 2010
  - Myth 4. Our labor laws protect labor. Quite the opposite. Present laws overprotect a tiny minority at the expense of the vast majority of workers. By making it extremely difficult to fire workers, our laws massively discourage the employment of new workers. They lead to huge under-utilization of our most abundant resource, low-skill labor.
  - What’s going on here? Who wins? Who loses?

Brazil

- EIU, Country Commerce Report
  - The 1988 federal constitution contains several important labour provisions: it legalises unions, collective bargaining negotiations, and the right to strike in both the public and private sectors. The constitution also sets overtime rates, provides a monthly minimum wage and regulates working hours. It lists a variety of labour entitlements, including the following: maternity leave, annual leave, workers’ compensation, social services, medical assistance and unemployment benefits.
  - What’s going on here? Who wins? Who loses?

Italy

- “Employment, Italian style,” WSJ, June 25, 2012
  - Once you hire employee 11, you must submit an annual self-assessment to the national authorities outlining every possible health and safety hazard to which your employees might be subject.
  - Once you hire your 16th employee, national unions can set up shop.
  - Hire No. 16 also means that your next recruit must qualify as disabled. By the time your firm hires its 51st worker, 7% of the payroll must be handicapped in some way.
  - What’s going on here? Who wins? Who loses?

Italy

- “Dangermen,” The Economist, Feb 18 2012:
  - A plaque marks the spot in Rome where Professor D’Antona was assassinated in 1999 by the Red Brigades. He was killed because he was working on plans for greater flexibility of Italy’s labor market. Marco Biagi, who took up his standard, was murdered by the same group three years later. The two killings testify to the resistance to reform in a country where jobs-for-life is the culture and youth unemployment is over 30%.
  - What’s going on here? Who wins? Who loses?

Japan

- EIU, Country Commerce Report
  - Japan’s labour system traditionally featured lifetime employment, elaborate fringe benefits, and wages based on length of service rather than performance. Most Japanese companies are finding this system increasingly difficult to sustain. But changing the social contract of lifetime employment has been difficult. The result is a massive number of unneeded workers in virtually every industry. The rigidity of the job market is partly offset by the growing presence of non-regular and part-time workers willing to work for less pay with no job security at all.
  - What’s going on here? Who wins? Who loses?
Japan

- “Misfire,” The Economist, June 15, 2013:
  - Many were disappointed by Abe’s “third arrow,” seeking to boost long-term economic performance. One area reformers hoped for progress was Japan’s labour market. Unless they are going out of business, firms are barred from firing employees. Companies hang on to their excess workers, leaving them unwilling to take on new employees or raise salaries.
- “Taxing times,” The Economist, Oct 5 2013:
  - A controversial loosening of labour rules on hiring and firing in special economic zones is under discussion.
- What’s going on here? Who wins? Who loses?

Spain

- EIU, Country Commerce Report
  - High rates of unemployment have hindered Spain’s economy for years, partly because of rigid labour laws that are among the strictest in the EU. Significant reforms that increase labour-market flexibility have been difficult to enact.
- What’s going on here? Who wins? Who loses?

Germany

- The Hartz reforms of 2002-05
  - Reduced benefits for long-term unemployment
  - Enhanced education and training
  - Facilitated private job sites
- Results
  - Employment and productivity up
  - Schroeder lost the next election
- What’s going on here? Who wins? Who loses?

US

- Econbrowser, November 2012
  - The recent health care legislation requires that large companies either provide health insurance for full-time workers or pay a fee. But the Wall Street Journal reports that some are taking a third route—shifting to more part-time workers.
- What’s going on here? Who wins? Who loses?

US

- Caroline Baum, Bloomberg, September 4, 2013:
  - A higher wage is great for the workers who keep their jobs; it isn’t so great for those who wouldn’t get hired. With a higher minimum wage, the cost of automating certain tasks suddenly becomes more affordable.
- What’s going on here? Who wins? Who loses?

What’s going on in Denmark?
Denmark’s “flexicurity” model

- Flexible labor markets
  - Flexible hours, easy to fire people
- Strong support for unemployed
  - Training programs
  - Subsidies to employers
- Results
  - Flexible labor market
  - Security for unemployed
  - Cost is 4-5% of GDP [OECD average 0.5%]

World Economic Forum
- Denmark continues to distinguish itself as having one of the most efficient labor markets internationally, with more flexibility in setting wages, firing, and therefore hiring workers than in the other Nordics and in most countries more generally.
- Who wins? Who loses?

What have we learned?
- Wide variation in labor market institutions/regulations
  - Something to keep in mind when you’re operating in another country
- Also variation in “outcomes”
  - Employment, unemployment, hours …
- In flexible labor markets
  - Easier to lose a job
  - Easier to get one
  - Who wins? Who loses?

After the break
- Be prepared to discuss Ghana

Roadmap
- Ghana mini-case
- What’s happening?
- Volatility
- The capital markets “game”
- Financial market institutions
- Crisis management
Ghana mini-case

- What features do you need in this business?
- How does Ghana stack up?
- Good idea – or not?

What’s happening?

- A disaster scenario
- Treasuries central to financial system
  - 4 trillion repo market central to financial liquidity
  - Trillions of trillions in interest rate derivatives
  - Benchmark for other markets
- Disruption could damage liquidity, possibly solvency
- Financial crisis ensues, all of us lose

Volatility

Equilibrium

- Call me when we get there

The idea

- Good economic performance requires effective labor and financial markets
- Especially in a volatile economic environment
- Financial markets are hard to get right
  - They require lots of “infrastructure”
  - “That’s where the money is”
  - They sometimes freeze up

Volatility

- Marx and Engels, *Communist Manifesto*, 1848
  - Everlasting uncertainty and agitation distinguish the *bourgeois epoch* from all earlier ones. All fixed, fast frozen relations ... are swept away, all new-formed ones become antiquated before they can ossify. All that is solid melts into air, all that is holy is profaned, and man is at last compelled to face with sober senses his real condition of life and his relations with his kind. *All old-established national industries have been destroyed or are daily being destroyed.* They are dislodged by new industries, whose introduction becomes a life and death question for all civilized nations.
- Does this sound right to you?
Volatility

- Joseph Schumpeter, *Capitalism, Socialism and Democracy*
  - The process of Creative Destruction is the essential fact about capitalism. In capitalist reality, competition...strikes not at the margins of the profits and the outputs of the existing firms but at their foundations and their very lives.
- Does this sound right to you?

Volatility

- Adam Davidson, *Planet Money*, March 2013
  - In January, 4.2 million were hired. And 4.1 million quit or were fired. In other words, every 1.6 seconds, someone got a job and someone else left a job. Even in good economic times, new jobs are constantly being created and old jobs are constantly being destroyed.
  - There’s a little-known jobs report that shows all this creation and destruction. It’s called the Job Openings and Labor Turnover Survey, though it typically goes by the catchy acronym JOLTS.
- What’s going on here?

Volatility

- Millions of farm jobs lost
- Millions of industrial jobs lost
- Where did they go?

Volatility

- Products come and go
- Firms come and go
- Industries come and go
- Good or bad?
- What does this mean for labor and capital markets?
Volatility

- In a volatile world, do you want
  - “Fixed, fast relations”? 
  - “Creative destruction”? 
  - Why?

France again

- Viscusi and Deen, “Why France…,” Bloomberg Business Week, May 2012:
  - Pierrick Haan, CEO of a medical supply company, notes: “The cost of labor isn’t the main problem, it’s the rigidities. If you make a mistake in your hiring plans, you can’t correct it.” He plans to expand production in Tunisia, Bulgaria, or Romania.
  - Worker groups say the labor code itself isn’t the issue. “If the code is complicated, it’s because our society is complicated. Cars are much more complicated today than they were 40 years ago. Why shouldn’t the labor code be?”
- What’s going on here?

Capital markets game

- A bit of game theory…
- Parameters:
  - Borrower has project that generates 100 + 15
  - Lender offers 100 to borrower for one year
  - Lender’s cost of funds is 5%, charges 10%
  - In default, borrower uses up 50, keeps the rest [Hmmm…]
- Where’s the value in this game?
- Who gets it?

What’s the outcome? What can we do about it?

L (0,0)
B

What’s the outcome? What can we do about it?
Capital markets game

- Note: creditor rights are good for borrowers
  - If default is attractive, lenders don’t lend
  - Result: projects not funded, TFP lower than it could be
- Evidence
  - States/countries with stronger creditor rights have more lending, lower rates
  - Also higher GDP per capita

Financial market institutions

- Obvious: enforce property rights
  - Protect creditors
  - Governance of firms
  - Disclosure
- Less obvious: manage financial crises
  - Why not let failures happen?
  - Meltzer: “Capitalism without failure is like religion without sin”
  - But: they cause collateral damage
  - How do we balance these things?

Days to enforce contracts

Cost of enforcing contracts

Investor protection (index)

### Financial markets in action

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>US</th>
<th>France</th>
<th>Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>6,297b</td>
<td>1,296b</td>
<td>5:1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biomedical researchers</td>
<td>77,000</td>
<td>12,000</td>
<td>6:1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public research funding</td>
<td>15.8b</td>
<td>1.8b</td>
<td>9:1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industry research funding</td>
<td>18.6b</td>
<td>2.8b</td>
<td>7:1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biotech patents</td>
<td>13,982</td>
<td>1051</td>
<td>13:1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biotech startups</td>
<td>1,100</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>27:1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publicly-traded biotechs</td>
<td>315</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>63:1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recombinant proteins</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>∞:1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Michelle Gittelman

### Managing crises

Financial crises happen

- Common in emerging markets
  - Asian crisis 1997
  - US: 1891, 1907, ...
- Developed countries too
  - Japan: 1990s
  - Scandinavia: 1990s
  - All over: 2008-09

Financial crises as “runs”

- Friedman and Schwartz on the 1930s
  - The failure of one bank can produce “runs” on other banks that in turn might force even “sound” banks to close
  - Federal deposit insurance has succeeded in achieving a major objective of reform, namely, the prevention of runs
- What are they saying? Do you agree? Disagree?

Financial crises: regulation basics

- Insolvent banking system bad for the economy
- Therefore: protect banks through regulation
  - Deposit insurance
  - Limits on risk
  - Capital requirements to cover risks that go bad
  - Look closely at large banks (“systemic”)
  - Central bank lending when needed
  - Just banks or also money market funds, hedge funds?
- [Mind-numbing detail, hard to get right]

Financial crises: open issues

- Are governments capable of doing this well?
  - Complex rules invite arbitrage
- Should failure be an option?
  - Let failures fail, deal with consequences
- Just banks?
  - Commercial paper? Money market funds?
What have we learned

- The world’s a volatile place
  - Products, companies, and industries come and go
- Financial markets facilitate the reallocation of capital
  - With good institutions, they work better
- But they’re subject to crises
  - A fact of life or something we can manage?

Problem Set #2

- Due next class
- Post questions on Announcements & Discussion
- Or email me

For the ride home

- Are markets “moral”?
- Would you use them to
  - Set wages and salaries?
  - Buy and sell goods from other countries?
  - Allocate kidneys for transplants?
  - Why or why not?
- Read mini-case on course website
- Come to class prepared to discuss